TEXAS BOARD OF VETERINARY MEDICAL EXAMINERS BOARD MEETING MINUTES October 28th, 2021

The Texas Board of Veterinary Medical Examiners met for a scheduled meeting on Thursday, October 28th, 2021, at 9:00am virtually via a Zoom conference call that was broadcast live on YouTube.

Agenda Item 1. Full Board Call to Order, Roll Call.

Jessica Quillivan, DVM, Board President, called the meeting to order at 9:04am. Board Members present were Jessica Quillivan, DVM; Lynn Criner, DVM, Secretary; Samantha Mixon, DVM; Randy Skaggs, DVM; Sue Allen, LVT; and Raquel Olivier. Victoria Whitehead joined the meeting virtually via zoom. Michael White, DVM was absent for roll call, but joined the meeting late. Board Staff present were: Executive Director, John Helenberg, Operations Director, Candice Simon; General Counsel, Brittany Sharkey; Enforcement Supervisor, Mike Tacker; and Executive Assistant, Patricia Prentice.

Victoria Whitehead joined the meeting virtually via zoom. Michael White, DVM was absent for roll call, but joined the meeting late. Keith Pardue, Board Vice President was absent.

Agenda Item 2. Consideration and Approval of the August 03, 2021, Minutes.

There were no corrections or discussions regarding the August 3, 2021, minutes.

Dr. Criner made a motion to approve the August 03, 2021, minutes, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 3. Executive Director's Report.

Mr. Helenberg spoke on several different subjects during the presentation of his report. The new data system is progressing; the licensing module is 95% complete and Enforcement module is currently at 80% complete. Legal and financial will begin after the full completion of the Enforcement module. TBVME currently has 2309 users in the system which is up from the 520 users reported at the last meeting in August.

Mr. Helenberg also gave a brief update on Continuing Education; staff changes and agency funding. With the passage of the proposed rule allowing Distance Education CE to satisfy the CE requirements, licensees should be able to show compliance for renewals occurring in January 2022. We will give a compliance grace period until March 2022.

Catherine Torres has resigned from the agency to pursue an opportunity in the private sector and Maricela Santibanez is no longer with the agency.

The New budget year began September 1, 2021, and is funded at the pre-COVID level.

Lastly, Mr. Helenberg provided department and case updates. The Licensing division currently has 10209 active DVM licenses, 2250 active LVT licenses and 60 Active EDP licenses. The Enforcement division currently has 175 active cases, with 80 cases in medical review. Enforcement has 32 new cases coming in and closes out 33 per month, with one remaining case in 2019. Legal is currently holding 407 cases withing their division with majority of those in pending IC and Pending Board action.

Agenda Item 4. Rules Committee Update.

Dr. Mixon gave a brief update on the Board's rules committee and what they have been working on. Dr. Mixon stated that the committee has done extensive research into the Alternative therapy and corresponding rules set by other Veterinary Board's across the country. The committee has reached the decision to rename the rule as Integrative Therapies rule as it is the most current term used with Board's across the country. In addition to that change, the Integrative Therapies rule will also be streamlined into an easy and fortified rule that will include a definition section which will explain each kind of integrative therapy. Lastly, Dr. Mixon stated that the rules committee has a goal to be more communitive with the public and stake holders and they have discussed how to get the rule changes and other information that is important to the stakeholders more efficiently.

Agenda Item 5. Consideration and approval of Agreed Orders.

Case#	Name	License #	Practice City			
CP18-174	Robert Hardy, DVM	7825	Austin, TX			
Non-voting n	nembers: N/A					
CP19-186	Robert Hardy, DVM	7825	Austin, TX			
Non-voting n	nembers: Dr. Criner					
CP20-060	Susan Boeving, DVM	7315	Southlake, TX			
Non-voting n	Non-voting members: N/A					
CP21-294	Jennifer Perusek, DVM	N/A	N/A			
Non-voting n	Non-voting members: N/A					

None of the above agreed orders were pulled for executive session.

Dr. Skaggs made a motion that the board approve the above agreed orders, Dr. White seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 6. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal by Informal Conference.

Case#	Name	License#	Practice City
CP19-142			
Non-voting members:			
CP19-238			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-345			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-365			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-368			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-370			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-385			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP20-013			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-026			
Non-voting members:			

CP20-053	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-096	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-115	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-138	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-143	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-156	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-157	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-228	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-247	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-292	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP21-255	
Non-voting members:	$\overline{N/A}$

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP20-228.

Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above informal conference dismissals, with the exceptions of the case that was pulled for executive session, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 7. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal from Medical Review.

Case #	Name	License #	Practice City
CP19-144			
Non-voting members:			
CP19-325			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-080			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-135			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-153			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-167			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-170			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-191			
Non-voting members:			

Case #	Name	License #	Practice City
CP20-193			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-194			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-210			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-279			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-280			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-295			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-319			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-332			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-384			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-392			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-413			
Non-voting members:			
CP20-418			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-017	<u> </u>		
Non-voting members:			
CP21-018			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-035			
Non-voting members: CP21-040			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-055			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-158			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-159			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-167			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-177			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-179			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-184			
Non-voting members:		<u> </u>	+
CP21-205			
Non-voting members:			
0	<u>i</u>		

Case #	Name	License #	Practice City
CP21-210			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-220			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-221			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-223			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-239			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-265			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-270			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-279			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-295			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-296			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-344			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-352			
Non-voting members:			
CP21-356			
Non-voting members:			

The following dismissal was pulled for executive session; CP21-223.

Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above medical review dismissals, with the exceptions of the case that was pulled for executive session, Dr. White seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 8. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal by Staff.

Case #	Name	License #	Practice City
CP19-007			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-021			
Non-voting members:	N/A	-	
CP19-037			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-237			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-268			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP19-269			
Non-voting members:	N/A		
CP20-050			
Non-voting members:	N/A		

CP20-112	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-187	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-192	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-241	
Non-voting members:	N/A
CP20-269	
Non-voting members:	$\overline{N/A}$
CP20-314	N/A
Non-voting members: CP20-336	
Non-voting members: CP20-337	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-397	
Non-voting members:	
CP20-407	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-126	
Non-voting members:	\ <u>\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\\</u>
CP21-157	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-165	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-168	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-169	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-247	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-249	
Non-voting members: CP21-260	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-272	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-276	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-286	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-293	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-302	
Non-voting members:	
CP21-333	
Non-voting members:	

CP21-334		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-375		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-377		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-380		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-390		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-401		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-402		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-405		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-408		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-411		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-426		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-427		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-443		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-447		
Non-voting members:		
CP21-453		
Non-voting members:		
CP22-022		
Non-voting members:	N/A	

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP20-112, CP20-241, CP20-269, CP21-126, CP21-247, CP21-272, and CP21-447.

Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, with the exceptions of the few cases that were pulled for executive session, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 9. Consideration and approval of Cease-and-Desist letters.

Case #	Name	License #	Practice City
CP21-371	Healthy Smiles Pet Dental	N/A	N/A
CP21-414	Michaela Corneau	N/A	N/A

The following dismissal was pulled for executive session; CP21-414.

Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above cease-and-desist letters, with the exceptions of the case that was pulled for executive session, Dr. White seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 10. Citizen Comments.

Jodi Ware

Texas Board of Veterinary Medical Examiners (TBVME) Board MeetingOctober 28, 2021

Agenda Item 10, Citizen CommentsJodi Ware

I would like to remind you that you are public servants and point out just a few of the many ways you are failing in your duties:

- 2016: Abandoning the former <u>Biennial Customer Service Report</u>
- 2016: Abandoning the former **Board Notes Newsletter**
- 2017: Ceasing inclusion of the former "Complaints by Period" log in Board meeting materials and no longer routinely apprising complainants of case updates/disposition(meaning complainants often don't know the status of their complaints—even long after dismissal)
- 2018: No longer posting Board meeting materials on the website before
 meetings—theyare now only released pursuant to open records requests after
 meetings, and often with significant stalling in violation of the Public
 Information Act (for the general public that is, not necessarily for the
 profession)
 - Brittany Sharkey recently admitted, "As a matter of practice, we send over Boardmeeting materials to the TVMA following each Board meeting."
- 2018: Revamping enforcement-related rules and procedures to a fault
- 2018: Shortening the statute of limitations from 4 years to 2 years without public notice(and in response to a licensee's comment on rule changes) thereby tossing 2 years' worth of complaints as newly non-jurisdictional
- 2018: No longer posting the complaint process on the TBVME website (despite Sunset'smandate to do so)
- 2019: Adopting a Schedule of Sanctions that prioritized licensee over public input and interests
- 2020: Halting public meetings and disciplinary conferences for many months
- 2020: Halting inspections (I believe through most of 2021)
- 2020: Newly permitting licensees to reject board orders and request second ICs
- 2021: Continuously stonewalling open records requests
 - I filed an open government complaint with the Office of the Attorney General on August 4 and have been able to submit numerous other examples of violations inreal time during the active investigation
 - It really is astonishing, the willful withholding of core or super public information—at least to the public, for the TBVME seems to offer a verydifferent level of customer service to the

veterinary profession

- Present: Parking SOAH cases at the TBVME
 - During the last TBVME meeting, John Helenberg said that 27 cases were at SOAH
 - In fact, they are not at SOAH or they would be a matter of public record
 - I contacted SOAH after the last board meeting, and its General Counsel informedme that no cases had been filed by the TBVME since October 2019
 - Brittany Sharkey, when push came to shove, released the attached informationre: cases pending SOAH and IC—as you can see, some of them date back years
 - Please note that these presumably comprise some of the worst offenders andyet the public has no way of knowing to avoid them
- Present: In the rare cases for which board orders are actually executed, putting the public at risk by incorrectly reflecting disciplinary action on TBVME lookup tool profiles
 - Dr. Skaggs specifically requested during the last board meeting that the faulty lookup tool be discussed during this meeting, and either Board staff ignored him or felt it wasn't an important enough topic to warrant its own agenda item
 - I ran the metrics for board orders issued FY2017 through FY2021, and anastounding 42% are not reflected on the lookup tool!
- Present: Making every effort to limit public participation in board meetings
 - I polled a half a dozen other professional boards in the Hobby Building (dental, medical, nursing, optometry, pharmacy, and physical therapy), and all are holding hybrid meetings with both on-site and virtual opportunities for public participation (in fact, some specifically encourage remote participation due to the pandemic)

My harrowing experience began with this agency in 2016, and I thought it couldn't get anyworse. I was terribly wrong. TBVME inactions on many fronts—not to mention deliberate actions to thwart public protections—are resulting in more harms than ever. I don't know how you can call yourselves public servants... the only public you seem to be serving is theprofession, alongside the TVMA.

Pending SO	AH		Pending IC		
FY17	FY18	FY19	FY19	FY20	FY21
CP17-047	CP18-033	CP19-002	CP19-078	CP20-011	CP21-001
CP17-271	CP18-037	CP19-110	CP19-090	CP20-013	CP21-003
CP17-302	CP18-056	CP19-234	CP19-131	CP20-026	CP21-007
CP17-303	CP18-062	CP19-241	CP19-132	CP20-038	CP21-010
CP17-312	CP18-108	CP19-349	CP19-140	CP20-053	CP21-011
CP17-375	CP18-109	CP19-400	CP19-238	CP20-096	CP21-025
	CP18-122	CP19-401	CP19-280	CP20-097	CP21-027
	CP18-168		CP19-343	CP20-098	CP21-033
	CP18-172		CP19-345	CP20-106	CP21-034
	CP18-174		CP19-356	CP20-107	CP21-032
	CP18-194		CP19-365	CP20-115	CP21-037
	CP18-303		CP19-368	CP20-121	CP21-041
	CP18-314		CP19-370	CP20-131	CP21-044

	CP18-340)	CP19-382	CP20-134	CP21-047
			CP19-384	CP20-137	CP21-056
			CP19-388	CP20-138	CP21-065
				CP20-141	CP21-085
				CP20-142	CP21-087
				CP20-143	CP21-105
				CP20-156	CP21-107
				CP20-157	CP21-122
				CP20-166	CP21-124
				CP20-179	CP21-128
				CP20-184	CP21-129
				CP20-186	CP21-135
				CP20-198	CP21-137
				CP20-199	CP21-161
				CP20-210	CP21-164
				CP20-220	CP21-175
				CP20-218	CP21-176
				CP20-228	CP21-183
				CP20-239	CP21-185
				CP20-245	CP21-189
				CP20-247	CP21-191
				CP20-248	CP21-197
				CP20-263	CP21-199
				CP20-287	CP21-213
				CP20-292	CP21-250
				CP20-300	CP21-251
				CP20-304	CP21-255
				CP20-308	CP21-266
				CP20-313	CP21-268
				CP20-326	CP21-300
				CP20-331	CP21-309
Pending S			Pending IC		
FY17	FY18	FY19	FY19	FY20	FY21
				CP20-358	CP21-315
				CP20-361	CP21-322
				CP20-381	CP21-323
					CP21-324
					CP21-325
					CP21-326
					CP21-327
					CP21-328
					CP21-331
					CP21-373
					CP21-377
					CP21-378

Judy Santerre:

My Public Comments for TBVME Board Meeting dated October 28, 2021:

I think it's sad to read in social media that people trust Facebook more than their veterinarians, but as a veterinary malpractice victim multiple times, I understandthe sentiment.

Our government has stripped our consumer protections from veterinarians who harm and kill our pets because of the interests of powerful lobbying industries (bigpharma and VMAs.)

Just like human healthcare, where medical errors are the third leading cause of death, veterinary errors are probably the biggest cause of pet deaths in this country,but I can't verify that because no one is counting.

The ethics of harming and killing pet patients – beloved family members – for whom veterinarians charge astronomical amounts of money while at the same timetheir lobbyists file amicus briefs in our courts to keep sham values intact is unconscionable. I heard a victim's story this week that the AVMA threatened them over their lawsuit against an obviously guilty veterinarian who had killed their dog. That's outrageous.

People who have lost pets to veterinarians are traumatized again when they turn to the agency they think is supposed to protect them, only to have their very obviouscases of malpractice tossed out to no violations found.

At the October 28, 2021 meeting, out of 116 cases the Board will toss 112, a rate of 97%. That is outrageous. Instead of covering up malpractice and deceptive practices, this board should be working to fix the problems causing them.

In an irony we victims of veterinary malpractice can appreciate, Board president Jessica Quillavan was complaining about the poor medical care her grandfather was receiving. She thinks veterinary care is better, but the agency is getting a record numbers of complaints, and that doesn't include the cases that are settled with non-disparagement and non-disclosure clauses.

From sham veterinary medical reviews to tossing 97% of complaints and giving noconsideration or empathy to the thousands of grieving pet owners who have lost beloved pets to malpractice, I'm wondering what the board is doing for consumers. The public deserves accountability and transparency of your activities.

The TVMA's purpose is to ensure its donors and veterinarians make a lot of money from people's love for their pets. This agency should focus on improving the <u>quality</u> of veterinary care, as well as promoting competition to address theunsustainable costs of veterinary care to consumers.

Two meetings ago, the Board approved a single board order for Michael Doherty that contained eight standard of care complaints, but that board order is not showing up in the licensee look up tool to warn consumers. He's listed as Active, but he's on Probated Suspension. He has other board orders that aren't showing upeither and all of them should be. He's a repeat offender and the public needs to know who he is. How many companion animals does he need to kill before you revoke his license? His is one of many board orders that aren't posted apparently to protect guilty veterinarians at the risk of consumers and their pets, including the two board orders of Stephanie Marie Mosley-Rogers, the only one of five veterinarians involved in the brutal gross veterinary malpractice death of my horse, Harvey. The look up tool shows no disciplinary action for her, which I find outrageous.

Keeping bad veterinarians in practice no matter how many pets they kill is wrongfor consumers and the industry. Lancet studies on human medicine clearly showbad medical care is worse than no care at all. The fix requires accountability, which is what this Board is supposed to be actively ensuring.

Agenda Item 11. Discussion of possible agenda items and date for future Board meetings.

The board set a date for the next quarterly board meeting that will take place on Tuesday January 25th at 9:00am. On the agenda the board would like to add the following agenda items; cease-and-desist procedures discussion; committee reassignments; wall licenses for signature and the board member manual.

Agenda Item 12. Executive Session to discuss pending and contemplated litigation and personnel matters.

The board entered Executive Session at 9:51am.

Agenda Item 13. Return from Executive Session to report or discuss further actions to be taken following Executive Session. Possible action on items discussed in Executive Session.

Executive Session ended at 10:48am

No Action was taken in Executive Session.

Agenda Item 6. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal from Informal Conference.

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP20-228.

The following cases were pulled for vote:

CP20-228—Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 7. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal from Medical Review.

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP21-223.

The following cases were pulled for vote:

CP21-223-- Dr. White made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, Dr. Quillivan, Dr. Mixon, Sue Allen and Ms. Olivier were opposed to dismiss this case. The motion failed and the case was sent back for review.

Agenda Item 8. Consideration and approval of cases recommended for dismissal from Medical Review.

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP20-112, CP20-241, CP20-269, CP21-126, CP21-247, CP21-272, and CP21-447.

The following cases were pulled for vote:

CP20-112-- Dr. Mixon made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, Dr. Criner seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP20-241-- Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, Ms. Olivier seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP20-269-- Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the staff dismissal, Dr. White seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP21-126-- Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the staff dismissal, Dr. Skaggs seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP21-247-- Dr. Criner made a motion that the board approve the staff dismissal, Dr. White seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP21-272-- Dr. Skaggs made a motion that the board approve the staff dismissal, Dr. Criner seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

CP21-447—There was no motion made to approve the staff dismissal. Motion fails, and the case is sent back for review.

Agenda Item 9. Consideration and approval of Cease-and-Desist letters.

The following dismissals were pulled for executive session; CP21-414

The following cases were pulled for vote:

CP21-414--Dr. Mixon made a motion that the board approve the above staff dismissals, Dr. Criner seconded the motion, and the motion was unanimously approved.

Agenda Item 14. Adjourn.

Dr. Criner made a motion to adjourn the October 28th, 2021, board meeting. Dr. White seconded, and the motion was unanimously passed.

Dr. Quillivan adjourned the meeting at 10:56am.